Environmental dependence of the correlations between stoichiometric and fatty acid-based indicators of phytoplankton nutritional quality

Rong Bi,^{1,2} Stefanie Ismar,² Ulrich Sommer,² Meixun Zhao¹*

¹Key Laboratory of Marine Chemistry Theory and Technology, Ocean University of China, Ministry of Education/Qingdao Collaborative Innovation Center of Marine Science and Technology, Qingdao, China ²Marine Ecology, GEOMAR Helmholtz-Zentrum für Ozeanforschung, Kiel, Germany

Abstract

Marine phytoplankton is simultaneously affected by multiple environmental drivers. To-date integrative assessments of multiple combined effects are rare on the relationship between elemental stoichiometry and biochemicals in marine phytoplankton. We investigated responses of stoichiometric (N:C and P:C ratios) and fatty acid-based (polyunsaturated fatty acid, PUFA) indicators of nutritional quality to three N:P supply ratios (10:1, 24:1, and 63:1 mol mol⁻¹), three temperatures (12, 18, and 24°C) and two pCO_2 levels (560 and 2400 µatm) in the marine phytoplankters Rhodomonas sp. and Phaeodactylum tricornutum. Overall, warming and nutrient deficiency showed dramatic effects, but increased pCO_2 had modest effects on the two indicators of nutritional quality. Specifically, warming showed strong positive effects on N:C and P:C ratios in Rhodomonas sp. but negative effects on PUFAs in both species. The low N- and low P-media led to low contents of both nutrients but high contents of PUFAs in the biomass of Rhodomonas sp., while the response of P. tricornutum was more complex: N:C ratios were lowest at the intermediate N:P supply but P:C ratios responded negatively to P deficiency and positively to N deficiency. Large variations in the two indicators of nutritional quality can be attributed to species-specific physiological optima and interactions between the three manipulated variables. Our results suggest that stoichiometric and FA-based indicators of nutritional quality may change differentially in response to warming and nutrient deficiency in marine phytoplankton, highlighting the relevance of simultaneous considerations of the two indicators of nutritional quality, when assessing food web dynamics under future ocean scenarios.

Ecological stoichiometry provides useful insights into the functioning of ecosystems based on the balance of multiple chemical substances in ecological interactions and processes (Sterner and Elser, 2002). Stoichiometric analysis has long been applied to chemical elements (Redfield, 1958; Hessen, 1997; Sterner and Elser, 2002; Galbraith and Martiny, 2015), and it may also be applied to certain biochemicals according to the extended stoichiometric hypothesis developed by Anderson and Pond (2000). Similar to elements like N and P, certain biochemicals, e.g., ω 3- and ω 6-polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFAs) are essential for animals, and thus they have been used as indicators of nutritional quality of food (Hessen, 2008; Müller-Navarra, 2008). A concept incorporating elemental stoichiometry and essential fatty acids (FAs) was been developed in studies of herbivorous zooplankton

nutrition in limnology (Gulati and Demott, 1997; Boersma et al., 2001; Ravet and Brett, 2006). However, systematic studies are still lacking on the relations between elements and FAs in marine phytoplankton and their importance for zooplankton (Lampert, 2009). As evidence for climate change on marine biota continues to accumulate (IPCC, 2014), insight into the responses of elemental ratios and biochemicals in marine phytoplankton to changing environments is needed to predict the planktonic food web dynamics in the oceans.

Multiple environmental factors will be concurrently altered by climate change in the oceans (Boyd et al., 2015). As one of the most critical problems of climate change, rising atmospheric CO₂ will increase partial CO₂ pressure (pCO₂) in the oceans [851–1370 μ atm by 2100 and 1371–2900 μ atm by 2150 (RCP8.5 scenario of the IPCC report 2014)] (IPCC 2014). Parallel to the change of pCO₂, rising temperature and enhanced nutrient deficiency due to shallower mixing depths will also impact much of the surface ocean (Doney et al., 2012; Moore et al., 2013). For example,

^{*}Correspondence: maxzhao@ouc.edu.cn

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article.

future warming will be superimposed on the strong presentday seasonal and inter-annual temperature variability of the source regions of the study strains: -3-21°C during 1990-1999 in the North Sea (Boersma et al., 2016) and ~0-21°C during 1990-2014 in the Baltic Sea (http://www.helcom.fi/ baltic-sea-trends/environment-fact-sheets/; last accessed date: 12.05.2016), with an increased annual mean sea surface temperature projected to reach 29.8°C in 2100 across the North Atlantic (0-60° N) (Lewandowska et al., 2014). Surface inorganic N and P are the most limiting nutrients for primary production in many areas of the oceans (Moore et al., 2013). While a high anthropogenic inputs such as the high N:P atmospheric deposition of \sim 370 mol mol⁻¹ drives toward a global scenario of an increase in the N:P ratio in the oceans (Peñuelas et al., 2012), a low N:P ratio occurs in many regions such as the N:P ratio of $\sim 6 \text{ mol mol}^{-1}$ in the center of the South Pacific Gyre (Bonnet et al., 2008; Moore et al., 2013). Although significant effort has been made to test the effect of single environmental factor on elemental ratio and FA composition of phytoplankton (Hutchins et al., 2009; Toseland et al., 2013; Bi et al., 2014), it is still a major challenge to understand the combined effects of multiple environmental drivers (MEDs) on chemical composition of phytoplankton (Domis et al., 2014; Verspagen et al., 2014; Cross et al., 2015).

Increasing attention is devoted to the interplay between MEDs on phytoplankton under the projected climate change scenarios (Xu et al., 2014a; Boyd et al., 2015; Flynn et al., 2015). To date, studies have focused on two concurrent variables (Rhee and Gotham, 1981; Staehr and Sand-Jensen, 2006; Sommer et al., 2015), while a few have examined three-way (Feng et al., 2008; Shi et al., 2015) or multi-way interactive effects of environmental factors (Xu et al., 2014b; Brennan and Collins, 2015). In most studies above, certain traits of phytoplankton have been intensively investigated, e.g., growth, photosynthesis, respiration, cell size and/or elemental content. However, less work has been conducted to simultaneously test stoichiometric and FA-based indicators of nutritional quality, and their relationship in response to the interactions of MEDs across different taxonomic groups.

In the present study, we focus on taxonomic comparisons of phytoplankton C:N:P stoichiometric and PUFA responses to N:P supply ratios, temperatures and pCO_2 , as well as the relationship between the two properties of nutritional quality. We chose two marine phytoplankters as representatives of common groups, the diatom *Phaeodactylum tricornutum* and the cryptophyte *Rhodomonas* sp. The ecological relevance of both phytoplankton groups are paramount, with diatoms generating most of the organic matter that serves as food in the seas (Armbrust, 2009), and cryptophytes being amongst the most common, and possibly among the most productive, flagellates in most aquatic environments (Sommer, 1987; Klaveness, 1989; Ikavalko, 1998). *P. tricornutum* and *Rhodomonas* sp. have long been used as model species in different studies such as evolutionary history of diatom genomes (Bowler et al., 2008), or unique photosynthetic antenna proteins of cryptophytes (Collini et al., 2010), and planktonic trophic dynamics (Jónasdóttir, 1994; Malzahn et al., 2007; Arndt and Sommer, 2014). Thus, studies on model algal species would be the basis to derive general findings for other algae and consumers. In this study, we addressed the following questions: (i) How does the combination of N:P supply ratio changes, temperature rise and increasing pCO_2 affect stoichiometric (N:C and P:C biomass ratios) and FA-based (PUFA contents) indicators of nutritional quality? (ii) How do the two indicators of nutritional quality correlate with each other? (iii) Does the correlation between the two indicators of nutritional quality vary with the changing culture conditions?

Methods

Study organisms and culture conditions

The cryptophyte Rhodomonas sp. and the bacillariophyte P. tricornutum (SAG, 1090-1b) were cultivated at a salinity of 37 psu in temperature-controlled rooms. The light intensity was constant at 100 μ mol photons \cdot m⁻² \cdot s⁻¹ at a light:dark cycle of 16:8 h. The culture medium was prepared with sterile filtered (0.2 µm pore size, Sartobran[®] P 300; Sartorius, Goettingen, Germany) North Sea water and enrichment nutrient solutions (macronutrients and micronutrients) based on the modified Provasoli's culture medium (Provasoli, 1963; Ismar et al., 2008). Macronutrients were added as sodium nitrate (NaNO₃) and potassium dihydrogen phosphate (KH₂PO₄), and dissolved background concentrations were negligible. For the diatom culture, also sodium silicate pentahydrate (Na₂SiO₃ \cdot 5H₂O) was added at a concentration of 88 μ mol · L⁻¹. Initial pCO₂ of the culture medium was manipulated by bubbling with the target pCO_2 . Each culture was kept in a sealed cell culture flask with 920 mL culture volume. All cultures were shaken manually twice per day at a set time. Three replicates were set up for each treatment.

Experimental setup

First, batch culture experiments were performed for each algal species under three N:P supply ratios, three temperatures and two pCO_2 levels. N:P supply ratios were manipulated as 10:1 mol mol⁻¹ (35.2 μ mol \cdot L⁻¹ N and 3.6 μ mol \cdot L⁻¹ P), 24:1 (88 μ mol \cdot L⁻¹ N and 3.6 μ mol \cdot L⁻¹ P) and 63:1 mol mol⁻¹ (88 μ mol \cdot L⁻¹ N and 1.4 μ mol \cdot L⁻¹ P). Temperatures were set to 12, 18 and 24°C, and target values of the two pCO_2 levels were 560 and 2400 μ atm. The chosen levels of N:P supply ratios, temperature and pCO_2 cover the ranges of typical changes of the three factors in natural conditions and they are also in agreement with future ocean projections (Peñuelas et al., 2012; Moore et al., 2013; IPCC, 2014; Lewandowska et al., 2014; Boersma et al., 2016). A temperature range of 6°C was set according to the ocean general circulation model under the IPCC SRES A1F1 scenario

(Lewandowska et al., 2014). The range of temperature also covers the optimum growth temperatures for both algal species (Hammer et al., 2002; Bojko et al., 2013). The observed maximal growth rate (μ_{max}) was estimated from cell number changes during the exponential growth phase (Bi et al., 2012).

Once batch cultures reached the early stationary phase, semi-continuous cultures were started with the specific growth rate $(\mu, \text{ day}^{-1})$ of 20% of μ_{max} for each treatment. The equivalent daily renewal rate $(D, \text{ day}^{-1})$ can be estimated by $D = 1 - e^{-\mu \cdot t}$, where *t* is renewal interval (day) (here t = 1 day). The incubation water was exchanged with fresh filtered seawater preacclimated to the desired pCO_2 level and CO_2 -enriched water. Renewal of the cultures was carried out at the same hour every day. The steady state in semicontinuous cultures was assessed based on the net growth rate (*r*). When *r* was zero (at steady state), μ was equivalent to *D*.

Sample analysis

Algal cell density and pH were measured daily. For pH measurements the electrode was calibrated daily using standard pH buffers (pH 4 and pH 7; WTW, Weilheim, Germany). At steady state, sampling was carried out during the same hour as the daily renewal of the cultures to avoid the effect of diel variations (Lacour et al., 2012) and subsequent variability in the data. For each treatment replicate, one sample was taken for analysis (the size of samples = 3 in each treatment). All cultures were sampled for the following parameters: cell density, dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), total alkalinity (TA), pH, particulate organic carbon, nitrogen and phosphorus (POC, PON and POP), and FAs.

DIC sampling and measurement were conducted according to Hansen et al. (2013). DIC samples were taken with a peristaltic pump into 10-mL glass vials. The filtration was conducted using a single-use syringe filter (0.2 μ m, Minisart RC25; Sartorius, Goettingen, Germany) which was connected to the intake tube of the pump. Vials were immediately sealed after filling. Subsequent analysis was carried out with a gas chromatographic system (8610C; SRI-Instruments, CA). TA samples were filtered through GF/F filters (Whatman GmbH, Dassel, Germany) and analyzed with the Tirino plus 848 (Metrohm, Filderstadt, Germany). The remaining carbonate parameter pCO₂ was calculated using CO2 SYS (Pierrot et al., 2006) and the constants supplied by Hansson (1973) and Mehrbach et al. (1973) that were refitted by Dickson and Millero (1987) and the KSO₄ dissociation constant from Dickson (1990) (Supporting Information Table S1).

For elemental and FA analysis, algal cells were harvested by filtration on pre-combusted and hydrochloric acid-treated GF/F filters (Whatman GmbH, Dassel, Germany). After filtration, samples for elemental analysis were immediately dried and stored in a desiccator, and samples for FA analysis were frozen at -80° C. The determination of POC and PON was carried out after Sharp (1974) by gas chromatography in an organic elemental analyzer (Thermo Flash 2000; Thermo Fisher Scientific, Schwerte, Germany). POP was analyzed colorimetrically by converting organic phosphorus compounds to orthophosphate (Hansen and Koroleff, 1999). FAs were measured as fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) using a gas chromatograph (Trace GC-Ultra; Thermo Fisher Scientific, Schwerte, Germany) according to the procedure described in detail in Arndt and Sommer (2014). The FAME 19:0 was added as internal standard and 21:0 added as esterification control. The extracted FAs were dissolved with n-hexane to a final volume of 100 μ L. Sample aliquots (1 μ L) were given into the GC by splitless injection with hydrogen as the carrier gas. Individual FAs were integrated using Chromcard software (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Schwerte, Germany) and identified with reference to commercially available standards, Supelco 37 component FAME mixture and Supelco Menhaden fish oil.

Statistics

Generalized linear mixed models (GLMMs) were used to investigate the factors determining phytoplankton stoichiometric and FA composition. GLMMs combine the properties of two statistical frameworks that are widely used in ecology and evolution, linear mixed models and generalized linear models (Bolker et al., 2009). They provide a more flexible approach for analyzing non-normal data such as count or proportion compared to classical statistical procedures (Bolker et al., 2009) and have been increasingly applied in ecology (Ye et al., 2013; Jamil et al., 2014). In this study, C:N:P stoichiometric ratios (as mol mol⁻¹) and cellular contents (as ng cell⁻¹ for C and N, and pg cell⁻¹ for P), and FA contents (as $\mu g m g^{-1} C^{-1}$) were considered as response variables, with N:P supply ratio, temperature and pCO_2 as fixed effects. Target distributions were tested and link functions were consequently chosen. For all response variables, models containing first order effects of the three factors, and second and third order interactions of all factors were tested. Model selection with the Akaike Information Criterion corrected (AICc) was used to determine the model that best predicted targets, with a lower AICc value representing a better fit of the model. Following Bolker et al. (2009), changes of 10 U or more in AICc values were considered as a reasonable improvement in the fitting of GLMMs. In case AICc values were comparable (<10 U difference), the simpler model was thus chosen, unless there were significant second or third order interactions detected. Differences in AICc values for all responses of cellular C:N:P contents and ratios were <10 between different models, with an exception of N:C biomass ratios in P. tricornutum, which showed around 11 points less of AICc in the model containing second order interactions than that only containing the first order effect (Supporting Information Table S2). Differences in AICc values for TFAs, SFAs and MUFAs in Rhodomonas sp., and PUFAs and EPA in

P. tricornutum were less than 10 between different models; however, those for PUFAs, ALA, EPA and DHA in *Rhodomonas* sp. and TFAs, SFAs and MUFAs in *P. tricornutum* were up to 50 points lower in the model containing only first order effects than in those also containing second and third order effects (Supporting Information Table S2).

 $\mu_{\rm max}$ values did not differ substantially between different N:P supply ratios in *Rhodomonas* sp. and *P. tricornutum* (Bi et al., 2012). Thus, the effects of temperature and pCO_2 on $\mu_{\rm max}$ were tested for each algal species using two factorial ANOVA. Dependent variables were checked for normality using the Shapiro–Wilk test and transformed (square) if required.

Linear regression analyses were used to test the relationship between N (and P) cell quota (Q_N and Q_P , as $\mu g m g^{-1} C^{-1}$) and the contents of each FA group (TFAs, SFAs, MUFAs, and PUFAs) under N (and P) deficiency (N:P supply ratios = 10:1 and 63:1). The same analysis was done for the relationship between cellular FA and POC contents.

GLMMs, ANOVA and linear regressions were conducted in SPSS 19.0 (IBM Corporation, NY). Significance level was set to p < 0.05 in all statistical tests.

Results

The observed maximal growth rate (μ_{max})

For both algal species, μ_{max} did not significantly differ between different temperature or $p\text{CO}_2$ treatments. However, the values of μ_{max} in *Rhodomonas* sp. showed a trend to increase with increasing temperature over the entire range of N:P supply ratio and $p\text{CO}_2$ (0.51 ± 0.06 to 0.66 ± 0.03 day⁻¹), while those in *P. tricornutum* (0.84 ± 0.02 to 0.87 ± 0.07 day⁻¹) showed no detectable pattern.

N:C and P:C biomass ratios

The results of GLMMs showed that N:C biomass ratios responded significantly to temperature changes in both algal species (Table 1). Species-specific responses were also observed, with a significant effect of N:P supply ratio and the interaction between temperature and N:P supply ratio on N:C biomass ratios in Rhodomonas sp., and a significant effect of pCO_2 and the interaction between temperature and pCO₂ on N:C biomass ratios in P. tricornutum (Table 1). Specifically, N:C biomass ratios in Rhodomonas sp. showed a positive response to increasing temperature under N deficiency (N:P supply ratio = 10:1) and the balanced nutrient condition (N:P supply ratio = 24:1), but a negative response to increasing temperature under P deficiency (N:P supply ratio = 63:1) (Table 2; Supporting Information Fig. S2a). In contrast, N:C biomass ratios in P. tricornutum showed a trend to decrease with increasing temperature under the low pCO_2 condition, but a trend to increase under the high pCO_2 condition (Table 2; Supporting Information Fig. S3b).

Similar to N:C biomass ratios, P:C biomass ratios also showed significant responses to temperature changes in both

algal species according to the GLMMs (Table 1). Speciesspecific responses were found, with the significant interaction between temperature and pCO₂ on P:C biomass ratios in Rhodomonas sp., and a significant effect of N:P supply ratio and the interaction between temperature and N:P supply ratio on P:C biomass ratios in P. tricornutum (Table 1). Specifically, P:C biomass ratios in Rhodomonas sp. were higher at higher temperatures, but this positive response became weaker as pCO2 increased (Table 2; Supporting Information Fig. S3c). Despite the non-significant response to N:P supply ratio, P:C biomass ratios in Rhodomonas sp. was around two times higher under N-deficient and balanced nutrient conditions than those under P deficiency (Table 2; Supporting Information Fig. S2b). In contrast to the responses to temperature rise in Rhodomonas sp., P:C biomass ratios in P. tricornutum were higher at the lowest temperature under N-deficient and balanced nutrient conditions (Table 2; Supporting Information Fig. S2b). Moreover, P:C biomass ratios in P. tricornutum decreased significantly with increasing N:P supply ratio, being around two to three times higher under N deficiency than under P deficiency.

Polyunsaturated fatty acids

GLMM results showed that the contents of PUFAs responded significantly to N:P supply ratio in both algal species, and PUFAs in *P. tricornutum* also responded significantly to the interaction between temperature and N:P supply ratio (Table 1). The contents of PUFAs in *Rhodomonas* sp. were markedly higher under N and P deficiency; however, PUFAs in *P. tricornutum* were slightly higher under P deficiency and lower temperatures (Table 2; Supporting Information Fig. S4d). Moreover, responses of PUFAs to increasing temperature in *Rhodomonas* sp. shifted from positive, negative to unimodal as N:P supply ratio increased, although the effects of temperature were not statistically significant.

Because of their high abundance and nutritional values, ALA (α -linolenic acid; 18:3n-3), EPA (eicosapentaenoic acid; 20:5n-3) and DHA (docosahexaenoic acid; 22:6n-3) in *Rhodomonas* sp. and EPA in *P. tricornutum* were considered as the most important single PUFAs. Significant responses were observed for ALA and EPA to N:P supply ratio in *Rhodomonas* sp., and DHA to temperature in *Rhodomonas* sp., but not for EPA in *P. tricornutum* (Table 1; Supporting Information Table S3). The contents of ALA in *Rhodomonas* sp. were markedly higher under N and P deficiency. While ALA, EPA, and DHA in *Rhodomonas* sp. showed a clear trend to decrease with increasing temperature in most cases, the contents of EPA increased with increasing temperature under N deficiency (Supporting Information Fig. S5).

Correlations between Q_N (and Q_P) and polyunsaturated fatty acids under N (and P) deficiency

Significant positive correlations were observed between $Q_{\rm N}$ and PUFAs under N deficiency for both algal species (Fig. 1). However, there was no significant correlation between $Q_{\rm P}$

Table 1. Overview of the significant results of the best-fit GLMMs testing for the effects of temperature, N:P supply ratio and pCO_2 on N:C and P:C biomass ratios, the contents of polyunsaturated fatty acids, and the contents of important single polyunsaturated fatty acids in *Rhodomonas* sp. and *Phaeodactylum tricornutum*.

Response variable	Factor	Coefficient ± SE	t	p	n
Rhodomonas sp.					
N:C biomass ratio (mol mol^{-1})	Intercept	-2.924 ± 0.254	-11.497	<0.001	54
	Т	$\textbf{0.058} \pm \textbf{0.013}$	4.380	<0.001	
	pCO ₂	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-0.494	0.624	
	N:P	$\textbf{0.016} \pm \textbf{0.005}$	3.042	0.004	
	$T \times pCO_2$	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-0.537	0.594	
	T×N:P	$-0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-4.014	<0.001	
	pCO ₂ ×N:P	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	1.478	0.146	
P:C biomass ratio (mmol mol ⁻¹)	Intercept	0.441 ± 0.295	1.496	0.141	54
	Т	$\textbf{0.083} \pm \textbf{0.015}$	5.402	<0.001	
	pCO ₂	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	1.466	0.149	
	N:P	-0.007 ± 0.006	-1.143	0.259	
	$T \times pCO_2$	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-2.111	0.040	
	T×N:P	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-1.299	0.200	
	pCO ₂ ×N:P	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-0.351	0.727	
PUFAs (μ g mg ⁻¹ C ⁻¹)	Intercept	153.82 ± 24.031	6.401	<0.001	51
	т	-1.514 ± 1.126	-1.344	0.185	
	pCO ₂	$< 0.001 \pm 0.006$	-0.066	0.948	
	N:P	0.785 ± 0.247	3.182	0.003	
ALA ($\mu q m q^{-1} C^{-1}$)	Intercept	3.644 ± 0.268	13.574	<0.001	51
	т	-0.011 ± 0.013	-0.875	0.368	
	pCO ₂	<0.001 ± <0.001	0.246	0.807	
	N:P	0.006 ± 0.003	2.192	0.033	
EPA ($\mu q m q^{-1} C^{-1}$)	Intercept	36.584 ± 4.355	8.401	<0.001	51
	Т	-0.255 ± 0.204	-1.247	0.218	
	nCO ₂	-0.001 ± 0.001	-0.837	0.407	
	N:P	-0.117 ± 0.045	-2.610	0.012	
DHA ($\mu q m q^{-1} C^{-1}$)	Intercept	17.056 ± 1.312	12.999	<0.001	51
	Т	-0.334 ± 0.061	-5.427	<0.001	
	nCO ₂	< 0.001 + < 0.001	-0.780	0.439	
	N:P	0.009 ± 0.013	0.657	0.514	
Phaeodactylum tricornutum					
N:C biomass ratio (mol mol $^{-1}$)	Intercept	-2.265 ± 0.090	-25,289	<0.001	53
···· ,	Т	-0.018 ± 0.005	-3.738	0.001	
	nCO ₂	< 0.001 + < 0.001	-5.665	<0.001	
	N:P	0.001 ± 0.002	0.860	0.394	
	$T \times n C \Omega_2$	<0.001 + <0.001	4 543	<0.001	
	T×N·P	<0.001 + <0.001	1 492	0 142	
	nCO ₂ ×N·P	<0.001 + <0.001	0 445	0.659	
P:C biomass ratio (mmol mol ^{-1})	Intercent	1.992 ± 0.212	9 41 2	<0.001	53
	т	-0.028 ± 0.011	-2 459	0.018	55
	nCO	$< 0.020 \pm 0.011$	-0.356	0 724	
	N·P	-0.025 + 0.004	-6.076	<0.727 <0.001	
	T×nCO-	$< 0.023 \pm 0.004$	0.070	0.675	
	ΤΧΝΙ-Ρ	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	0.422 2 812	0.075	
			-0.578	0.566	
	$\rho c c_2 \wedge i n r$	<0.001 ± <0.001	-0.370	0.300	

Response variable	Factor	Coefficient ± SE	t	р	n
PUFAs (µg mg ⁻¹ C ⁻¹)	Intercept	4.420 ± 0.100	44.408	<0.001	51
	Т	-0.008 ± 0.005	-1.421	0.162	
	pCO ₂	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	0.707	0.483	
	N:P	$\textbf{0.007} \pm \textbf{0.002}$	3.330	0.002	
	$T \times p CO_2$	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-0.694	0.492	
	T×N:P	$< 0.001 \pm < 0.001$	-2.986	0.005	
	pCO ₂ ×N:P	$<\!0.001\pm<\!0.001$	0.625	0.536	

Significant p values are shown in bold; n is the number of observations. T: temperature; N:P: N:P supply ratio; PUFAs: polyunsaturated fatty acids; ALA: α -linolenic acid (18:3n-3); EPA: eicosapentaenoic acid (20:5n-3); DHA: docosahexaenoic acid (22:6n-3).

and PUFAs under P deficiency. The correlations between Q_N and PUFAs were species-specific and temperature-dependent. In *Rhodomonas* sp., Q_N correlated positively with PUFAs over the entire range of temperature (Fig. 1a). In contrast, Q_N in *P. tricornutum* showed no significant correlation with PUFAs over the entire range of temperature, with a significant positive correlation observed when excluding data from the lowest temperature (Fig. 1b).

Responses of both PON/PUFAs and POP/PUFAs ratios to temperature and N:P supply ratio differed between the two species, with those in *Rhodomonas* sp. being more responsive than in *P. tricornutum* (Fig. 2). In *Rhodomonas* sp., PON/PUFAs and POP/PUFAs were generally higher under the balanced nutrient condition and the highest temperature (Fig. 2a,b). However, PON/PUFAs in *P. tricornutum* showed no clear difference between different N:P supply ratio or temperature treatments (Fig. 2c), and POP/PUFAs showed a trend to decrease with increasing N:P supply ratio (Fig. 2d).

Discussion

Our results show complex and in many cases interactive influences of temperature, N:P supply ratio and pCO_2 on stoichiometric and FA-based nutritional quality in marine phytoplankton (Fig. 3 for a systematic summary). Overall, warming and nutrient deficiency showed dramatic effects on the nutritional quality of the two algal species, while increased pCO_2 had more modest effects, with significant interactive effects observed between temperature and N:P supply ratio (or pCO_2). The relative importance of warming and nutrient deficiency is in principle consistent with a postulated ranking of environmental factors for five major phytoplankton groups, which showed temperature, photosynthetic available radiation and nutrients (N and P) as the most important factors for phytoplankton abundance (Boyd et al. 2010). Specifically, we could observe differential shifts between positive and negative correlations between stoichiometric and FA-based indicators of nutritional quality with temperature. Our results thus highlight that one type of nutritional quality indicator alone, either elemental or

339

biochemical can only incompletely reflect phytoplankton quality for higher trophic levels in marine food webs.

Phytoplankton stoichiometric responses

Temperature showed the most consistent significant contribution to the variation in elemental nutritional quality of the two algal species in our study (Table 1), showing up to 83% changes in C:N:P stoichiometry in response to warming (Fig. 3). These significant impacts of temperature on algal stoichiometry in this study are in agreement with recent results of field research, which demonstrate temperature as the primary factor explaining variation in algal N:P and C:P ratios on a global scale (Yvon-Durocher et al., 2015). Although the global patterns of C:N:P ratios in ocean plankton communities exhibit a strong latitudinal trend, i.e. higher N:P and C:P ratios in warmer environments (Martiny et al., 2013; Yvon-Durocher et al., 2015), taxonomic differences in responses of phytoplankton to warming were observed in previous work (Thompson et al., 1992; Taucher et al., 2015) and the present study (Fig. 3). Several mechanisms are proposed to illustrate stoichiometric responses to temperature. The temperature-dependent physiology hypothesis predicts that organisms in warm environments require fewer P-rich ribosomes, relative to N-rich proteins, to sustain growth and maintenance (Thompson et al., 1992; Woods et al., 2003; Yvon-Durocher et al., 2015). In line with this hypothesis, we observed an overall decreased P:C biomass ratios and increased N:C biomass ratios with increasing temperature in P. tricornutum. In contrast, the growth rate hypothesis (GRH) suggests that low C:P and N:P biomass ratios in rapidly growing organisms reflect increased allocation to P-rich ribosomal RNA, as rapid protein synthesis by ribosomes is required to support fast growth (Elser et al., 2000). This positive linkage between P content and growth rate can explain the overall increased N:C and P:C biomass ratios and higher growth rates at higher temperatures in Rhodomonas sp. The inconsistent predictions between the temperature-dependent physiology hypothesis and the GRH might be explained by calculations in a recent review (Cross et al., 2015), which suggest that the increased P content associated with rapid growth in warm conditions may be

Table 2. N:C and P:C biomass ratios and polyunsaturated fatty acid contents (mean \pm SD) under three N:P supply ratios, three temperature scenarios and two pCO_2 levels in *Rhodomonas* sp. and *Phaeodactylum tricornutum*.

	N:C biomass	P:C biomass	DIJEAc
Treatment	$(mol mol^{-1})$	(mmol mol^{-1})	$(\mu g m g^{-1} C^{-1})$
Rhodomonas s	n	. , ,	
N deficiency	p.		
$1CO_{2}$ 12°C	0 079 + 0 001	3 007 + 0 192	148 2 + 2 141
1_{1}^{1} 1_{2	0.075 ± 0.001	5.671 ± 0.772	174.6 ± 6.402
1_{CO_2} 24°C	0.145 ± 0.003	6.630 ± 1.747	165.4 ± 9.035
HCO_{2} , 24 C	0.143 ± 0.003 0.072 ± 0.001	3302 ± 0363	105.4 ± 1.035 146.9 + 1.037
$HCO_{2}, 12^{\circ}C$	0.072 ± 0.001 0.107 ± 0.004	3.302 = 0.303 4 825 + 0 409	181.8 ± 14.17
HCO_{2} 10 C	0.107 ± 0.004 0.126 ± 0.002	4.023 ± 0.407 5 889 ± 0 241	172.9 ± 10.97
Ralanced nutri	ent condition	5.007 = 0.241	172.7 = 10.77
	0.158 ± 0.005	3 680 + 0 132	1278+6511
$100_{2}, 120$	0.130 ± 0.003 0.171 ± 0.002	5.000 ± 0.132	127.0 ± 0.011 125.1 ± 0.047
$100_{2}, 180$	0.171 ± 0.002 0.210 ± 0.024	0.333 ± 0.273 8 765 ± 1 121	123.1 ± 9.947
$LCO_{2,} 24C$	0.210 ± 0.024 0.122 ± 0.006	0.703 ± 1.121	122.7 ± 12.27
$HCO_{2,}$ 12 C	0.133 ± 0.000	4.360 ± 1.200	122.7 ± 12.37
$HCO_{2}, 18C$	0.136 ± 0.003	3.460 ± 1.200	112.4 ± 15.91
$HCO_{2,}$ 24 C	0.176 ± 0.006	7.048 ± 0.320	79.00 ± 3.031
P deficiency	0 1 2 2 1 0 0 2 2	2146 0 242	100.0 + 6.052
$LCO_{2,} 12^{\circ}C$	0.122 ± 0.002	2.146 ± 0.342	190.8 ± 6.952
LCO _{2,} 18°C	0.117 ± 0.003	2.292 ± 0.250	228.4 ± 27.39
LCO _{2,} 24°C	0.120 ± 0.010	3.820 ± 0.267	154.2 ± 14.45
HCO ₂ , 12°C	0.143 ± 0.004	1.989 ± 0.207	173.4 ± 6.105
HCO _{2,} 18°C	0.117 ± 0.001	2.164 ± 0.176	195.8 ± 6.843
HCO _{2,} 24°C	0.116 ± 0.003	2.801 ± 0.141	178.4 ± 0.226
Phaeodactylum	n tricornutum		
N deficiency			
LCO _{2,} 12°C	0.081 ± 0.005	5.344 ± 0.145	84.39 ± 9.188
LCO _{2,} 18°C	0.085 ± 0.002	3.679 ± 1.170	71.98 ± 4.441
LCO _{2,} 24°C	0.067 ± 0.002	$\textbf{3.889} \pm \textbf{0.115}$	67.31 ± 2.032
HCO _{2,} 12°C	0.064 ± 0.001	4.738 ± 0.112	82.37 ± 2.328
HCO _{2,} 18°C	0.078 ± 0.002	4.094 ± 0.307	71.64 ± 1.861
HCO _{2,} 24°C	0.072 ± 0.001	4.116 ± 0.103	68.84 ± 2.613
Balanced nutrie	ent condition		
LCO _{2,} 12°C	$\textbf{0.080} \pm \textbf{0.002}$	$\textbf{2.873} \pm \textbf{0.163}$	$\textbf{77.68} \pm \textbf{14.67}$
LCO _{2,} 18°C	$\textbf{0.078} \pm \textbf{0.001}$	$\textbf{2.411} \pm \textbf{0.102}$	$\textbf{77.19} \pm \textbf{1.568}$
LCO _{2,} 24°C	0.072 ± 0.003	$\textbf{2.817} \pm \textbf{0.628}$	66.72 ± 11.25
HCO ₂ , 12°C	0.065 ± 0.001	$\textbf{2.843} \pm \textbf{0.384}$	83.09 ± 8.866
HCO ₂ , 18°C	0.064 ± 0.001	2.241 ± 0.020	$\textbf{76.63} \pm \textbf{1.868}$
HCO ₂ 24°C	0.071 ± 0.007	$\textbf{2.429} \pm \textbf{0.244}$	71.96 ± 3.437
P deficiency			
LCO ₂ 12°C	$\textbf{0.093} \pm \textbf{0.001}$	1.691 ± 0.119	89.62 ± 8.571
LCO ₂ 18°C	$\textbf{0.098} \pm \textbf{0.001}$	1.807 ± 0.023	82.00 ± 1.215
LCO ₂ 24°C	0.091 ± 0.001	1.912 ± 0.134	67.86 ± 0.763
HCO ₂ 12°C	0.083 ± 0.001	1.680 ± 0.041	103.3 ± 2.057
HCO ₂ 18°C	0.082 ± 0.001	1.505 ± 0.067	81.40 ± 1.115
HCO ₂ 24°C	0.094 ± 0.001	1.929 ± 0.249	70.96 ± 10.98

N deficiency, N:P = 10:1 mol mol⁻¹; Balanced nutrient condition, 24:1 mol mol⁻¹; P deficiency, 63:1 mol mol⁻¹. LCO₂, 560 μ atm; HCO₂, 2400 μ atm. PUFAs: polyunsaturated fatty acids.

masked by larger decreases in P content due to other factors such as patterns of nutrient condition and biodiversity (Woods et al., 2003).

Indeed, we observed significant interactions between temperature and N:P supply ratio (or pCO_2), showing that N:P supply ratio or pCO_2 can change the extent or even reverse the effect of temperature on N:C and P:C biomass ratios in our two study taxa (Supporting Information Figs. S2 and S3). Our results show that the effect of warming on stoichiometric responses was more pronounced under lower N:P supply ratios, or under the low pCO₂ condition in Rhodomonas sp., and under lower N:P supply ratios in P. tricornutum. Because of the interactions between temperature and nutrients, the influence of increasing global temperature on phytoplankton growth showed seasonal changes in natural phytoplankton communities in lakes (Frederiksborg Slotssø, Denmark) (Staehr and Sand-Jensen, 2006). Our study suggests that nutrient availability and pCO₂ can alter the effect of warming on elemental quality of phytoplankton, which furthers our understanding of MEDs influences on phytoplankton stoichiometry.

Furthermore, stoichiometric responses to temperature, N:P supply ratio and pCO_2 differed between the two species in our study (Fig. 3). For example, we observed up to 83% enhancement of N:C biomass ratios in response to warming in Rhodomonas sp., but a much less pronounced change $(\leq 2\%)$ in *P. tricornutum*. Our results are consistent with the findings by Thompson et al. (1992) and Montagnes and Franklin (2001), which showed stronger changes in stoichiometry in the cryptophyte Rhodomonas salina but moderate responses in P. tricornutum. These different responses may be attributed to different adaptations to temperature (Montagnes and Franklin, 2001), nutrients (Bi et al., 2012), and variable mechanisms regulating C acquisition (Giordano et al., 2005; Wu et al., 2014) between the two species. The expression of the CO₂ concentrating mechanisms (CCMs) has been well characterized in several algal groups such as diatoms (Hopkinson et al., 2011; Raven et al., 2012), while less is known about its mechanism in cryptophytes. Also, environmental conditions can modulate the CCM activity (Beardall and Giordano, 2002; Raven et al., 2012), but limited data are currently available on the interactions of multiple factors. Therefore, additional research is needed to fully assess the mechanisms and mathematical dynamics of the interplay between temperature and nutrients (or pCO_2) on phytoplankton stoichiometry.

Phytoplankton polyunsaturated fatty acid responses

N and P deficiency had the most significant contribution to the variation of PUFA contents in the two algal species in this work (Table 1), showing up to 76% changes in PUFAs in response to nutrient deficiency (Fig. 3). Although light intensity and temperature are probably the most commonly observed factors affecting FA composition of photosynthetic



Fig. 1. Linear regressions between N cell quota (Q_N) and polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFAs) under N deficiency for (**a**) *Rhodomonas* sp. and (**b**) *Phaeodactylum tricornutum*. Solid lines: regressions over the entire range of temperature; broken lines: regressions at higher temperatures (18 and 24°C).



Fig. 2. The ratios of particulate organic nitrogen (and phosphorus) vs. polyunsaturated fatty acids (PON/PUFAs and POP/PUFAs) as functions of N:P supply ratio under different temperatures for (**a** and **b**) *Rhodomonas* sp. and (**c** and **d**) *Phaeodactylum tricornutum*.

tissues or organisms, nutrient availability has also shown a significant impact on FA composition of algae (Guschina and Harwood, 2006). For example, the importance of nutrient availability on FA composition was observed in mesocosm experiments conducted with natural phytoplankton communities of marine, brackish and freshwater systems (Brepohl, 2005). Our results provided additional evidence for the importance of N:P supply ratio on PUFAs in two marine phytoplankters (representing two algal groups). Furthermore, the overall responses of PUFAs to nutrient deficiency showed no consistent pattern between the two species, with more than 58% enhancement in Rhodomonas sp. but less than 9% changes in P. tricornutum (Fig. 3). Interspecific differences in the responses of PUFAs to nutrient deficiency may be attributed to the association of PUFAs with different lipid types such as triacylglycerols, phospholipids and phospholipids substitutions (Bi et al., 2014). Moreover, nutrient levels seem to influence the slope of the correlations between cellular POC and FAs in Rhodomonas sp., showing higher slopes under the balanced nutrient condition (Supporting Information Fig. S6 a-d), suggesting that a larger part of C may be fixed in non-FA molecules, e.g., carbohydrates, under nutrient replete conditions.

Warming showed an overall negative effect on PUFAs in both algal species in our study, resulting in <20% changes in PUFAs (Fig. 3). This negative effect of warming on PUFAs was also found in tropical *Rhodomonas* sp. and *P. tricornutum* (Jiang and Gao, 2004) and another diatom *Odontella aurita*



Fig. 3. The changes in stoichiometric (N:C and P:C biomass ratios) and fatty acid-based (polyunsaturated fatty acids, PUFAs) indicators of nutritional quality in response to warming, N and P deficiency (-N and -P), and enriched pCO_2 in *Rhodomonas* sp. and *Phaeodactylum tricornutum* based on the data in Table 1 and Table 2. Here is shown not only significant and substantial effects on the two indicators of nutritional quality, but also moderate and non-significant first order effects, some of these include significant two-factorial interactions. Significant interactions between temperature (T) and N:P supply ratio (or pCO_2) are presented based on GLMM results in Table 1, and corresponding response patterns are shown in Supporting Information Fig. S2–S4. Red arrows indicate a mean percent increase, and blue arrows indicate a mean percent decrease in a given response.

(Pasquet et al., 2014). Unsaturated FAs become higher to maintain membrane fluidity, which is suggested to provide a membrane of constant viscosity, i.e., homeoviscosity, at low temperatures (Sinensky, 1974; Los et al., 2013). However, positive and unimodal responses of PUFAs to warming were also found in Rhodomonas sp. in our study (Table 2; Supporting Information Fig. S4d) and other algal species in previous work (Renaud et al., 1995; Piepho et al., 2012; Roleda et al., 2013). For Rhodomonas sp. in this work, the lower PUFAs at the lowest temperature under N deficiency was due to the markedly decrease in EPA, while other major PUFA components (ALA and DHA) showed only moderate changes under the same condition (Supporting Information Fig. S5). Our results suggest that nutrient deficiency may influence temperature-dependent modification of FA unsaturation in certain algal species, e.g., the inhibition of N deficiency on elongation or desaturation of precursors to produce EPA in *Rhodomonas* sp. at the lowest temperature.

Partial CO₂ pressure showed a non-significant effect on PUFAs in either species in our study (Table 1). This negligible effect of pCO_2 on phytoplankton FA composition was also found in monocultures of other species from different phyla such as Cyanobacteria, Bacillariophyta, and Rhodophyta (Tsuzuki et al., 1990; Shi et al., 2015), and in a natural

plankton community (Leu et al., 2013). Under different pCO_2 levels, not only FAs but also other biochemicals such as sterols and amino acids can be changed in phytoplankton (Gordillo et al., 1998; Riebesell et al., 2000; Bermudez et al., 2015). For example, cellular FA, protein or β –1,3-glucan contents in the diatom *Thalassiosira pseudonana* showed no significant differences between two pCO_2 levels; however, the cellular β –1,3-glucan content showed a larger variation than FAs in response to pCO_2 (Shi et al., 2015). We thus suggest that other biochemicals, such as sterols (Müller-Navarra, 2008), may be influenced by pCO_2 . Further research is recommended to explore the responses of variable biochemicals to pCO_2 and other factors.

Correlations between stoichiometric and FA-based nutritional quality of phytoplankton and implications for zooplankton nutrition

The results discussed above suggest that stoichiometric and FA-based indicators of nutritional quality responded differently under different combinations of environmental factors; therefore, both need to be studied if an integrative assessment of nutritional value to higher trophic levels is required. In the present study, we focus on the potential limitation of elements and PUFAs on zooplankton nutrition

Environmental dependence of nutritional quality

under nutrient deficiency, and thus the relationship between Q_N (and Q_P) and PUFAs was tested under N (and P) deficiency. We found that the correlations between Q_N and PUFAs under N deficiency at higher temperatures (18 and 24°C; Fig. 1) are consistent with the findings by Bi et al. (2014), which showed a positive correlation between Q_N and PUFAs in P. tricornutum but a negative correlation in Rhodomonas sp. under N deficiency at 18°C. Moreover, we observed a shift from negative to positive correlations between Q_N and PUFAs in Rhodomonas sp., and a lack of significant correlation between Q_N and PUFAs in P. tricornutum when data at the lowest temperature (12°C) were included. The correlations between N (and P) content and PUFAs in phytoplankton have been widely studied in freshwater environments (Müller-Navarra, 1995; Wacker and Von Elert, 2001; Gladyshev et al., 2007), which helped to understand the relative importance of the two properties of nutritional food quality in regulating zooplankton nutrition (Müller-Navarra, 1995; Park et al., 2002). The present study shows species-specific and temperature-dependent covariance of Q_N and PUFAs (under N deficiency) in two marine phytoplankters, providing important empirical data to understanding of the relations of elements and FAs in marine zooplankton nutrition.

Interestingly, we also found that PON/PUFAs and POP/ PUFAs changed along the gradients of temperature and N:P supply ratio (Fig. 2). According to the extended stoichiometric hypothesis, the ratio of N (or P) and essential PUFAs in phytoplankton correlates negatively with the strength of limitation of N (or P) relative to essential PUFAs in zooplankton production (Anderson and Pond, 2000). Our results therefore indicate that higher PON/PUFAs and POP/PUFAs may lead to a lower probability of N (or P) limitation relative to PUFAs for zooplankton feeding Rhodomonas sp. at the balanced nutrient and high temperature conditions; and decreased POP/PUFAs may lead to an increasing probability of P limitation relative to PUFAs for zooplankton feeding P. tricornutum as N:P supply ratio increased. However, it must be noted that zooplankton production also depends on its nutritional requirements (Anderson and Pond, 2000). It is well known that the nutritional requirements of consumers change with prey nutritional status and environmental factors by regulating behavior (e.g., ingestion process) or physiological controls (e.g., metabolism) (Mitra and Flynn, 2005; Sperfeld and Wacker, 2011; Acheampong et al., 2014). Clearly, further work is required to incorporate elements and FAs of both consumers and prey in studies of marine planktonic trophic dynamics.

General conclusions

This study evaluated the variability of major element ratios (N:C and P:C) and PUFA contents in response to MEDs (N:P supply ratio, temperature and pCO_2) in two

model species as representatives of common phytoplankton groups. Overall, our results scaled the relative importance of the three environmental factors, showing that warming and N (and P) deficiency had the most pronounced effects on elemental ratios and PUFAs, respectively. The effect trends of the three factors on the nutritional quality of phytoplankton are consistent with previous work, to some extent revealing the general relevance of our findings for phytoplankton. However, species-specific responses were also observed in our study, suggesting that the implications of this study should be tested with more phytoplankton species from different groups in future studies. Moreover, significant interactions between the three environmental factors suggest that the effect of temperature can be modified by nutrient conditions and pCO_2 . We also observed the covariance of Q_N and PUFAs (under N deficiency) in both algal species, and the shifts of PON/PUFAs and POP/PUFAs in dependence of temperature, N:P supply ratio and algal species. This work thus provides a useful basis for simultaneous inter-comparison of elements and FAs in future studies on food web dynamics in the face of climate change.

References

- Acheampong, E., I. Hense, and M. A. St John. 2014. A model for the description of feeding regulation by mesozooplankton under different conditions of temperature and prey nutritional status. Ecol. Model. **272**: 84–97. doi: 10.1016/j.ecolmode1.2013.09.009
- Anderson, T. R., and D. W. Pond. 2000. Stoichiometric theory extended to micronutrients: Comparison of the roles of essential fatty acids, carbon, and nitrogen in the nutrition of marine copepods. Limnol. Oceanogr. **45**: 1162–1167. doi: 10.4319/lo.2000.45.5.1162
- Armbrust, E. V. 2009. The life of diatoms in the world's oceans. Nature **459**: 185–192. doi: 10.1038/nature08057
- Arndt, C., and U. Sommer. 2014. Effect of algal species and concentration on development and fatty acid composition of two harpacticoid copepods, *Tisbe* sp. and *Tachidius discipes*, and a discussion about their suitability for marine fish larvae. Aquac. Nutr. **20**: 44–59. doi: 10.1111/anu.12051
- Beardall, J., and M. Giordano. 2002. Ecological implications of microalgal and cyanobacterial CO₂ concentrating mechanisms, and their regulation. Funct. Plant Biol. 29: 335–347. doi: 10.1071/pp01195
- Bermudez, R., and others. 2015. Long-term conditioning to elevated pCO₂ and warming influences the fatty and amino acid composition of the diatom *Cylindrotheca fusiformis*. Plos One. **10**: e0123945. doi: 10.1371/ journal.pone.0123945
- Bi, R., C. Arndt, and U. Sommer. 2012. Stoichiometric responses of phytoplankton species to the interactive effect of nutrient supply ratios and growth rates. J. Phycol. **48**: 539–549. doi: 10.1111/j.1529-8817.2012.01163.x

Environmental dependence of nutritional quality

Bi et al.

- Bi, R., C. Arndt, and U. Sommer. 2014. Linking elements to biochemicals: Effects of nutrient supply ratios and growth rates on fatty acid composition of phytoplankton species.
 J. Phycol. 50: 117–130. doi: 10.1111/jpy.12140
- Boersma, M., C. Schöps, and E. Mccauley. 2001. Nutritional quality of seston for the freshwater herbivore *Daphnia galeata* × *hyalina*: Biochemical versus mineral limitations. Oecologia. **129**: 342–348. doi: 10.1007/s004420100728
- Boersma, M., N. Gruener, N. T. Signorelli, P. E. M. Gonzalez, M. A. Peck, and K. H. Wiltshire. 2016. Projecting effects of climate change on marine systems: Is the mean all that matters? Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 283: 20152274. doi: 10.1098/rspb.2015.2274
- Bojko, M. K., and others. 2013. Temperature effect on growth, and selected parameters of *Phaeodactylum tricornutum* in batch cultures. Acta Biochim. Pol. **60**: 861–864.
- Bolker, B. M., M. E. Brooks, C. J. Clark, S. W. Geange, J. R. Poulsen, M. H. H. Stevens, and J. S. S. White. 2009. Generalized linear mixed models: a practical guide for ecology and evolution. Trends Ecol. Evol. 24: 127–135. doi: 10.1016/j.tree.2008.10.008
- Bonnet, S., and others. 2008. Nutrient limitation of primary productivity in the Southeast Pacific (BIOSOPE cruise). Biogeosciences. 5: 215–225. doi: 10.5194/bg-5-215-2008
- Bowler, C., and others. 2008. The *Phaeodactylum* genome reveals the evolutionary history of diatom genomes. Nature **456**: 239–244. doi: 10.1038/nature07410
- Boyd, P. W., R. Strzepek, F. Fu, and D. A. Hutchins. 2010. Environmental control of open-ocean phytoplankton groups: Now and in the future. Limnol. Oceanogr. **55**: 1353–1376. doi: 10.4319/lo.2010.55.3.1353
- Boyd, P. W., S. T. Lennartz, D. M. Glover, and S. C. Doney. 2015. Biological ramifications of climate-change-mediated oceanic multi-stressors. Nat. Clim. Change. 5: 71–79. doi: 10.1038/nclimate2441
- Brennan, G., and S. Collins. 2015. Growth responses of a green alga to multiple environmental drivers. Nat. Clim. Change. 5: 892–897. doi: 10.1038/nclimate2682
- Brepohl, D. C. 2005. Fatty acids distribution in marine, brackish and freshwater plankton during mesocosm experiments. Ph.D. thesis. Christian-Albrechts-University Kiel.
- Collini, E., C. Y. Wong, K. E. Wilk, P. M. G. Curmi, P. Brumer, and G. D. Scholes. 2010. Coherently wired light-harvesting in photosynthetic marine algae at ambient temperature. Nature **463**: 644–647. doi: 10.1038/nature08811
- Cross, W. F., J. M. Hood, J. P. Benstead, A. D. Huryn, and D. Nelson. 2015. Interactions between temperature and nutrients across levels of ecological organization. Glob. Change Biol. 21: 1025–1040. doi: 10.1111/gcb.12809
- Dickson, A. 1990. Standard potential of the reaction: $AgCl(s) + 1/2H_2(s) + HCl(aqu)$ and the standard acidity constant of the ion HSO_4^- in synthetic sea water from 273.15 to 318.15 K. J. Chem. Thermodyn. **22**: 113–127. doi: 10.1016/0021-9614(90)90074-Z

- Dickson, A., and F. Millero. 1987. A comparison of the equilibrium constants for the dissociations of carbonic acid in seawater media. Deep-Sea Res. 34: 1733–1741. doi: 10.1016/0198-0149(87)90021-5
- Domis, L.N.D.S., D. B. Van De Waal, N. R. Helmsing, E. Van Donk, and W. M. Mooij. 2014. Community stoichiometry in a changing world: Combined effects of warming and eutrophication on phytoplankton dynamics. Ecology. 95: 1485–1495. doi: 10.1890/13-1251.1
- Doney, S. C., and others. 2012. Climate change impacts on marine ecosystems. Annu. Rev. Mar. Sci. **4**: 11–37. doi: 10.1146/annurev-marine-041911-111611
- Elser, J. J., and others. 2000. Biological stoichiometry from genes to ecosystems. Ecol. Lett. **3**: 540–550. doi: 10.1111/j.1461-0248.2000.00185.x
- Feng, Y., M. E. Warner, Y. Zhang, J. Sun, F. X. Fu, J. M. Rose, and D. A. Hutchins. 2008. Interactive effects of increased *p*CO₂, temperature and irradiance on the marine coccolithophore *Emiliania huxleyi* (Prymnesiophyceae). Eur. J. Phycol. **43**: 87–98. doi: 10.1080/09670260701664674
- Flynn, K. J., and others. 2015. Ocean acidification with (de)eutrophication will alter future phytoplankton growth and succession. Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. **282**: 20142604. doi: 10.1098/rspb.2014.2604
- Galbraith, E. D., and A. C. Martiny. 2015. A simple nutrientdependence mechanism for predicting the stoichiometry of marine ecosystems. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. **112**: 8199–8204. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1423917112
- Giordano, M., J. Beardall, and J. A. Raven. 2005. CO₂ concentrating mechanisms in algae: Mechanisms, environmental modulation, and evolution. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. **56**: 99–131. doi: 10.1146/annurev.arplant.56.032604. 144052
- Gladyshev, M., N. Sushchik, A. Kolmakova, G. Kalachova, E. Kravchuk, E. Ivanova, and O. Makhutova. 2007. Seasonal correlations of elemental and ω 3 PUFA composition of seston and dominant phytoplankton species in a eutrophic Siberian Reservoir. Aquat. Ecol. **41**: 9–23. doi: 10.1007/s10452-006-9040-8
- Gordillo, F. J. L., M. Goutx, F. L. Figueroa, and F. X. Niell. 1998. Effects of light intensity, CO₂ and nitrogen supply on lipid class composition of *Dunaliella viridis*. J. Appl. Phycol. **10**: 135–144. doi: 10.1023/a:1008067022973
- Gulati, R., and W. Demott. 1997. The role of food quality for zooplankton: Remarks on the state-of-the-art, perspectives and priorities. Freshw. Biol. **38**: 753–768. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2427.1997.00275.x
- Guschina, I. A., and J. L. Harwood. 2006. Lipids and lipid metabolism in eukaryotic algae. Prog. Lipid Res. **45**: 160–186. doi: 10.1016/j.plipres.2006.01.001
- Hammer, A., R. Schumann, and H. Schubert. 2002. Light and temperature acclimation of *Rhodomonas salina* (Cryptophyceae): Photosynthetic performance. Aquat. Microb. Ecol. **29**: 287–296. doi: 10.3354/ame029287

Environmental dependence of nutritional quality

Bi et al.

- Hansen, H. P., and F. Koroleff. 1999. Determination of nutrients, p. 159–228. In K. Grasshoff, K. Kremling, and M. Ehrhardt [eds.], Methods of seawater analysis. WILEY-VCH.
- Hansen, T., B. Gardeler, and B. Matthiessen. 2013. Technical Note: Precise quantitative measurements of total dissolved inorganic carbon from small amounts of seawater using a gas chromatographic system. Biogeosciences **10**: 6601– 6608. doi: 10.5194/bg-10-6601-2013
- Hansson, I. 1973. A new set of acidity constants for carbonic acid and boric acid in seawater. Deep-Sea Res. **20**: 661–678. doi: 10.1016/0011-7471(73)90100-9
- Hessen, D. O. 1997. Stoichiometry in food webs—Lotka revisited. Oikos. **79**: 195–200. doi: 10.2307/3546108
- Hessen, D. O. 2008. Efficiency, energy and stoichiometry in pelagic food webs: Reciprocal roles of food quality and food quantity. Freshwater Rev. 1: 43–57. doi: 10.1608/frj-1.1.3
- Hopkinson, B. M., C. L. Dupont, A. E. Allen, and F. M. M. Morel. 2011. Efficiency of the CO₂-concentrating mechanism of diatoms. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA **108**: 3830– 3837. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1018062108
- Hutchins, D. A., M. R. Mulholland, and F. Fu. 2009. Nutrient cycles and marine microbes in a CO₂-enriched ocean. Oceanography **22**: 128–145. doi: 10.5670/oceanog.2009. 103
- Ikavalko, J. 1998. Further observations on flagellates within sea ice in northern Bothnian Bay, the Baltic Sea. Polar Biol. **19**: 323–329. doi: 10.1007/s003000050253
- IPCC. 2014. Climate change 2014: Synthesis report. Contribution of working groups I, II and III to the fifth assessment report of the intergovernmental panel on climate change, IPCC. Geneva, Switzerland.
- Ismar, S. M. H., T. Hansen, and U. Sommer. 2008. Effect of food concentration and type of diet on *Acartia* survival and naupliar development. Mar. Biol. **154**: 335–343. doi: 10.1007/s00227-008-0928-9
- Jamil, T., C. Kruk, and C. J. F. Ter Braak. 2014. A unimodal species response model relating traits to environment with application to phytoplankton communities. Plos One. 9: e97583. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0097583
- Jiang, H., and K. Gao. 2004. Effects of lowering temperature during culture on the production of polyunsaturated fatty acids in the marine diatom *Phaeodactylum tricornutum* (Bacillariophyceae). J. Phycol. **40**: 651–654. doi: 10.1111/ j.1529-8817.2004.03112.x
- Jónasdóttir, S. H. 1994. Effects of food quality on the reproductive success of *Acartia tonsa* and *Acartia hudsonica*: Laboratory observations. Mar. Biol. **121**: 67–81. doi: 10.1007/ BF00349475
- Klaveness, D. 1989. Biology and ecology of the Cryptophyceae: Status and challenges. Biol. Oceanogr. **6**: 257–270. doi: 10.1080/01965581.1988.10749530
- Lacour, T., A. Sciandra, A. Talec, P. Mayzaud, and O. Bernard. 2012. Diel variations of carbohydrates and

neutral lipids in nitrogen-sufficient and nitrogen-starved cyclostat cultures of *Isochrysis* sp. J. Phycol. **48**: 966–975. doi: 10.1111/j.1529-8817.2012.01177.x

- Lampert, W. 2009. Foreword, v-vi In M. T. Arts, M. T. Brett, and M. J. Kainz [eds.], Lipids in aquatic ecosystems. Springer.
- Leu, E., M. Daase, K. G. Schulz, A. Stuhr, and U. Riebesell. 2013. Effect of ocean acidification on the fatty acid composition of a natural plankton community. Biogeosciences. **10**: 1143–1153. doi: 10.5194/bg-10-1143-2013
- Lewandowska, A. M., D. G. Boyce, M. Hofmann, B. Matthiessen, U. Sommer, and B. Worm. 2014. Effects of sea surface warming on marine plankton. Ecol. Lett. 17: 614–623. doi: 10.1111/ele.12265
- Los, D. A., K. S. Mironov, and S. I. Allakhverdiev. 2013. Regulatory role of membrane fluidity in gene expression and physiological functions. Photosynth. Res. **116**: 489–509. doi: 10.1007/s11120-013-9823-4
- Malzahn, A. M., N. Aberle, C. Clemmesen, and M. Boersma. 2007. Nutrient limitation of primary producers affects planktivorous fish condition. Limnol. Oceanogr. 52: 2062–2071. doi: 10.4319/lo.2007.52.5.2062
- Martiny, A. C., C. T. A. Pham, F. W. Primeau, J. A. Vrugt, J. K. Moore, S. A. Levin, and M. W. Lomas. 2013. Strong latitudinal patterns in the elemental ratios of marine plankton and organic matter. Nat. Geosci. 6: 279–283. doi: 10.1038/ngeo1757
- Mehrbach, C., C. Culberson, J. Hawley, and R. Pytkowicz. 1973. Measurement of the apparent dissociation constants of carbonic acid in seawater at atmospheric pressure. Limnol. Oceanogr. 18: 897–907. doi: 10.4319/lo.1973.18.6.0897
- Mitra, A., and K. J. Flynn. 2005. Predator-prey interactions: Is 'ecological stoichiometry' sufficient when good food goes bad? J. Plankton Res. 27: 393–399. doi: 10.1093/ plankt/fbi022
- Montagnes, D. J. S., and D. J. Franklin. 2001. Effect of temperature on diatom volume, growth rate, and carbon and nitrogen content: Reconsidering some paradigms. Limnol. Oceanogr. **46**: 2008–2018. doi: 10.4319/lo.2001.46.8.2008
- Moore, C. M., and others. 2013. Processes and patterns of oceanic nutrient limitation. Nat. Geosci. **6**: 701–710. doi: 10.1038/ngeo1765
- Müller-Navarra, D. C. 1995. Evidence that a highly unsaturated fatty acid limits *Daphnia* growth in nature. Arch. Hydrobiol. **132**: 297–307.
- Müller-Navarra, D. C. 2008. Food web paradigms: The biochemical view on trophic interactions. Internat. Rev. Hydrobiol. **93**: 489–505. doi: 10.1002/iroh.200711046
- Park, S., M. T. Brett, D. C. Müller-Navarra, and C. R. Goldman. 2002. Essential fatty acid content and the phosphorus to carbon ratio in cultured algae as indicators of food quality for *Daphnia*. Freshw. Biol. **47**: 1377–1390. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2427.2002.00870.x
- Pasquet, V., L. Ulmann, V. Mimouni, F. Guiheneuf, B. Jacquette, A. Morant-Manceau, and G. Tremblin. 2014.

Fatty acids profile and temperature in the cultured marine diatom *Odontella aurita*. J. Appl. Phycol. **26**: 2265–2271. doi: 10.1007/s10811-014-0252-3

- Peñuelas, J., J. Sardans, A. Rivas-Ubach, and I. A. Janssens. 2012. The human-induced imbalance between C, N and P in Earth's life system. Glob. Change Biol. 18: 3–6. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02568.x
- Piepho, M., M. T. Arts, and A. Wacker. 2012. Species-specific variation in fatty acid concentrations of four phytoplankton species: Does phosphorus supply influence the effect of light intensity or temperature? J. Phycol. **48**: 64–73. doi: 10.1111/j.1529-8817.2011.01103.x
- Pierrot, D., E. Lewis, and D. Wallace. 2006. MS Excel program developed for CO₂ system calculations: ORNL/ CDIAC-105a. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Centre, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, US Department of Energy.
- Provasoli, L. 1963. Growing marine seaweeds, p. 9–17 In A. D. De Virville and J. Feldmann [eds.], Proc. 4th internatl. Seaweed Symp. Pergamon Press.
- Raven, J. A., M. Giordano, J. Beardall, and S. C. Maberly. 2012. Algal evolution in relation to atmospheric CO₂: Carboxylases, carbon-concentrating mechanisms and carbon oxidation cycles. Philos. T. Roy. Soc. B. **367**: 493– 507. doi: 10.1098/rstb.2011.0212
- Ravet, J. L., and M. T. Brett. 2006. Phytoplankton essential fatty acid and phosphorus content constraints on *Daphnia* somatic growth and reproduction. Limnol. Oceanogr. **51**: 2438–2452. doi: 10.4319/lo.2006.51.5.2438
- Redfield, A. C. 1958. The biological control of chemical factors in the environment. Am. Sci. **64**: 205–221.
- Renaud, S. M., H. C. Zhou, D. L. Parry, L. V. Thinh, and K. C. Woo. 1995. Effect of temperature on the growth, total lipid content and fatty acid composition of recently iso-lated tropical microalgae *Isochrysis* sp, *Nitzschia closterium*, *Nitzschia paleacea*, and commercial species *Isochrysis* sp (clone T ISO). J. Appl. Phycol. **7**: 595–602. doi: 10.1007/bf00003948
- Rhee, G. Y., and I. J. Gotham. 1981. The effect of environmental factors on phytoplankton growth: Temperature and the interactions of temperature with nutrient limitation1. Limnol. Oceanogr. 26: 635–648. doi: 10.4319/ lo.1981.26.4.0635
- Riebesell, U., A. T. Revill, D. G. Holdsworth, and J. K. Volkman. 2000. The effects of varying CO_2 concentration on lipid composition and carbon isotope fractionation in *Emiliania huxleyi*. Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac. **64**: 4179–4192. doi: 10.1016/s0016-7037(00)00474-9
- Roleda, M. Y., S. P. Slocombe, R. J. G. Leakey, J. G. Day, E. M. Bell, and M. S. Stanley. 2013. Effects of temperature and nutrient regimes on biomass and lipid production by six oleaginous microalgae in batch culture employing a two-phase cultivation strategy. Bioresour. Technol. **129**: 439–449. doi: 10.1016/j.biortech.2012.11.043

- Sharp, J. 1974. Improved analysis for particulate organic carbon and nitrogen from seawater. Limnol. Oceanogr. 19: 984–989. doi: 10.4319/lo.1974.19.6.0984
- Shi, D., W. Li, B. M. Hopkinson, H. Hong, D. Li, S. J. Kao, and W. Lin. 2015. Interactive effects of light, nitrogen source, and carbon dioxide on energy metabolism in the diatom *Thalassiosira pseudonana*. Limnol. Oceanogr. 60: 1805–1822. doi: 10.1002/lno.10134
- Sinensky, M. 1974. Homeoviscous adaptation—A homeostatic process that regulates the viscosity of membrane lipids in *Escherichia coli*. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. **71**: 522–525. doi: 10.1073/pnas.71.2.522
- Sommer, U. 1987. Factors controlling the seasonal variation in phytoplankton species composition—A case study for a deep, nutrient rich lake (Lake Constance). Prog. Phycol. Res. **5**: 122–178.
- Sommer, U., C. Paul, and M. Moustaka-Gouni. 2015. Warming and ocean acidification effects on phytoplankton— From species shifts to size shifts within species in a mesocosm experiment. Plos One. **10**: e0125239. doi: 10.1371/ journal.pone.0125239
- Sperfeld, E., and A. Wacker. 2011. Temperature- and cholesterol-induced changes in eicosapentaenoic acid limitation of *Daphnia magna* determined by a promising method to estimate growth saturation thresholds. Limnol. Oceanogr. 56: 1273–1284. doi: 10.4319/lo.2011.56.4.1273
- Staehr, P. A., and K. Sand-Jensen. 2006. Seasonal changes in temperature and nutrient control of photosynthesis, respiration and growth of natural phytoplankton communities. Freshw. Biol. **51**:249–262. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2427.2005.01490.x
- Sterner, R. W., and J. J. Elser. 2002. Ecological stoichiometry: The biology of elements from molecules to the biosphere. Princeton University Press.
- Taucher, J., J. Jones, A. James, M. A. Brzezinski, C. A. Carlson, U. Riebesell, and U. Passow. 2015. Combined effects of CO_2 and temperature on carbon uptake and partitioning by the marine diatoms *Thalassiosira weissflogii* and *Dactyliosolen fragilissimus*. Limnol. Oceanogr. **60**: 901–919. doi: 10.1002/lno.10063
- Thompson, P. A., M. X. Guo, and P. J. Harrison. 1992. Effects of variation in temperature. I. On the biochemcial composition of eight species of marine phytoplankton. J. Phycol. **28**: 481–488. doi: 10.1111/j.0022-3646.1992.00481.x
- Toseland, A., and others. 2013. The impact of temperature on marine phytoplankton resource allocation and metabolism. Nat. Clim. Change. **3**: 979–984. doi: 10.1038/nclimate1989
- Tsuzuki, M., E. Ohnuma, N. Sato, T. Takaku, and A. Kawaguchi. 1990. Effects of CO_2 concentration during growth on fatty acid composition in microalgae. Plant Physiol. **93**: 851–856. doi: 10.1104/pp.93.3.851
- Verspagen, J. M. H., D. B. Van De Waal, J. F. Finke, P. M. Visser, and J. Huisman. 2014. Contrasting effects of rising CO₂ on primary production and ecological stoichiometry

at different nutrient levels. Ecol. Lett. **17**: 951–960. doi: 10.1111/ele.12298

- Wacker, A., and E. Von Elert. 2001. Polyunsaturated fatty acids: Evidence for non-substitutable biochemical resources in *Daphnia galeata*. Ecology. **82**: 2507–2520. doi: 10.1890/0012-9658(2001)082[2507:PFAEFN]2.0.CO;2
- Woods, H. A., W. Makino, J. B. Cotner, S. E. Hobbie, J. F. Harrison, K. Acharya, and J. J. Elser. 2003. Temperature and the chemical composition of poikilothermic organisms. Funct. Ecol. **17**: 237–245. doi: 10.1046/j.1365-2435.2003.00724.x
- Wu, Y., D. A. Campbell, A. J. Irwin, D. J. Suggett, and Z. V. Finkel. 2014. Ocean acidification enhances the growth rate of larger diatoms. Limnol. Oceanogr. 59: 1027–1034. doi: 10.4319/lo.2014.59.3.1027
- Xu, J., K. Gao, Y. Li, and D. A. Hutchins. 2014a. Physiological and biochemical responses of diatoms to projected ocean changes. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 515: 73–81. doi: 10.3354/meps11026
- Xu, K., F. X. Fu, and D. A. Hutchins. 2014b. Comparative responses of two dominant Antarctic phytoplankton taxa to interactions between ocean acidification, warming, irradiance, and iron availability. Limnol. Oceanogr. 59: 1919–1931. doi: 10.4319/lo.2014.59.6.1919
- Ye, L., C. Y. Chang, C. Garcia-Comas, G. C. Gong, and C. H. Hsieh. 2013. Increasing zooplankton size diversity enhances the strength of top-down control on phytoplankton

through diet niche partitioning. J. Anim. Ecol. **82**: 1052–1060. doi: 10.1111/1365-2656.12067

Yvon-Durocher, G., M. Dossena, M. Trimmer, G. Woodward, and A. P. Allen. 2015. Temperature and the biogeography of algal stoichiometry. Global Ecol. Biogeogr. 24: 562– 570. doi: 10.1111/geb.12280

Acknowledgments

The authors thank Thomas Hansen, Cordula Meyer, Bente Gardeler, and Petra Schulz for technical assistance. They thank Lea Kraienhemke, Dorthe Ozod-Seradj, Si Li, Xupeng Chi, Carolin Paul and Yong Zhang for their help during the experiments, and Philipp Neitzschel for helping with DIC measurements. This study was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant No. 41506086; No. 41521064; No. 41520104009), the Scientific Research Foundation for the Returned Overseas Chinese Scholars, State Education Ministry (Grant No. [2015] 1098), Postdoctoral Foundation of Shandong Province (Grant No. 201402037), the "111" Project (B13030) and GEOMAR Helmholtz-Zentrum für Ozeanforschung Kiel. This is MCTL contribution 129.

Conflict of Interest

None declared.

Submitted 17 December 2015 Revised 18 May 2016 Accepted 25 July 2016

Associate editor: Thomas Anderson